



*Create Safe Communities - Defend the Rule of Law - Advance the Constitution*

---

Press Alert: 20 September 2010

## DA Miscalculates Reduction in Khayelitsha Crime

1. On Monday 13 September 2010 the Social Justice Coalition (SJC) sent a letter to Dianne Kohler Barnard MP (DA shadow minister of Police), copied to Helen Zille (Leader of the DA and Premier of the Western Cape). In this letter (attached as annexure A) the SJC explained that what appeared to be an error in calculation had been made in a widely circulated DA statement dated 29 August 2010, in which Kohler Barnard claimed that crime in Khayelitsha had declined by 70% over five years. We illustrated that this decline was in fact 24% over 5 years. Moreover, if one uses the latest police statistics, the reduction in crime in the area has decreased to 17% since 2003/2004.
2. The SJC intended for the correspondence to remain private, as we wanted to present Kohler Barnard and the DA with sufficient opportunity to retract their statement in an appropriate manner. On Wednesday 15 September 2010 Kohler Barnard responded, and acknowledged that a mistake had been made, and that “the correct figure is a 24% reduction in crime in Khayelitsha, and a correction will be posted on our website, as well as with the press” (see annexure B).
3. On Friday 17 September 2010, the DA made an effort to issue a correction in a manner we find to be wholly inadequate and evasive. In an email received from DA Parliamentary Chief Operations Officer Ross Van Der Linde (See annexure C), we were informed that the DA would not issue a full statement on their website, but instead add a correction to the original statement of 29 August located in their archives<sup>1</sup>. In addition, correspondence with the press would be limited to a “correction” sent only to the *Cape Times*, as Van Der Linde claimed it was “the only newspaper to run this story”. A brisk internet search shows that the story was covered by numerous local and national news sources including the *Cape Argus*<sup>2</sup>, *Business Day*<sup>3</sup>, *iol*<sup>4</sup>, *Politicsweb*<sup>5</sup>, *Eyewitness Radio News*<sup>6</sup> (servicing *567 Cape Talk* and *702 Talk Radio*), *iafrica news*<sup>7</sup>, *The Times*<sup>8</sup>, *Legalbrief*<sup>9</sup> and *SAPA*. The statement was discussed on various radio stations, and was also distributed on various DA mailing lists.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.da.org.za/newsroom.htm?action=view-news-item&id=8633>

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.capeargus.co.za/?fSectionId=3571&fArticleId=vn20100831064134267C765962&utm\\_source=timesguardian.com&utm\\_medium=web&utm\\_campaign=AFL\\_TrafficShare](http://www.capeargus.co.za/?fSectionId=3571&fArticleId=vn20100831064134267C765962&utm_source=timesguardian.com&utm_medium=web&utm_campaign=AFL_TrafficShare)

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.businessday.co.za/articles/Content.aspx?id=119969>

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.iol.co.za/index.php?set\\_id=1&click\\_id=6&art\\_id=vn20100831064134267C765962](http://www.iol.co.za/index.php?set_id=1&click_id=6&art_id=vn20100831064134267C765962)

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.politicsweb.co.za/politicsweb/view/politicsweb/en/page71654?oid=195728&sn=Detail&pid=71616>

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.eyewitnessnews.co.za/articleprog.aspx?id=47323>

<sup>7</sup> <http://news.iafrica.com/politics/news/660066.html>

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.timeslive.co.za/local/article638000.ece/6841>

<sup>9</sup> <http://www.legalbrief.co.za/article.php?story=20100901080705681>

 Address: SHAWCO Centre K2, G323 Mongezi Road, Khayelitsha, Cape Town

 Tel: 021 361 8160 ·  Fax: 086 503 6213 ·  Cell: 083 777 99 8 1

Email: [gavinsilber@gmail.com](mailto:gavinsilber@gmail.com)

[www.socialjusticecoalition.org](http://www.socialjusticecoalition.org)



4. As the original statement was widely disseminated and discussed, it is important for the nature of the error and the correct information to be circulated widely. The nature and seriousness of the challenges presented by crime renders such information very much in the public interest.
5. On Wednesday 15 September 2010 four of the nine suspects accused of raping and murdering Zoliswa Nkonyana escaped from Khayelitsha Magistrate Court. This trial – which the SJC, TAC, Free Gender and other organisations have been following closely for years– has been postponed more than 25 times since 2006. This failure to deliver justice is unfortunately not an isolated incident, but common for those forced to make use of the overburdened and under-resourced Khayelitsha police Services and courts. Crime – both violent and property related – in areas like Khayelitsha continues to affect residents more so than in any other part of the Western Cape. People are assaulted, robbed, raped, and murdered daily conducting tasks that many people living outside of informal settlements take for granted, like using toilet or accessing transport to work. Justice in areas such as these has become a privilege, not a right. The nature of this crisis requires that members of the public and policy makers alike have an accurate perception of the scope of the problem, if we are to succeed in ensuring that progress is made.

**[ENDS]**



## **Annexure A** (Letter from SJC to Dianne Kohler Barnard – 13 September 2010)

13 September 2010

Att: **Ms. Diane Kohler Barnard MP**  
Shadow Minister of Police, Democratic Alliance

Cc: **Ms. Helen Zille**  
Leader, Democratic Alliance / Premier, Western Cape

### **Error in Calculating Reduction in Khayelitsha Crime**

Dear Ms. Kohler Barnard,

1. The Social Justice Coalition (SJC) is a grassroots membership based organisation located in Khayelitsha. Our primary campaign focuses on ensuring that all people in South Africa have their constitutional right to safety and security upheld.
2. On 29 August 2010 the Democratic Alliance (DA) released a press statement in which you – in your capacity as Shadow Minister of Police - claimed that there had been a “70% drop” in crime in Khayelitsha over 5 years<sup>10</sup>. You noted that “16 648 criminal incidents were reported in Khayelitsha in 2003/2004, but in 2008/2009, that number plummeted to 5 046”. While such a reduction would be a significant achievement, it has come to our attention that this calculation is incorrect, and seriously exaggerates progress in an area still plagued by crime.
3. It appears that an error in calculation occurred due to a failure to incorporate statistics from Harare<sup>11</sup> and Lingeletu-West<sup>12</sup> Police stations – two additional stations that are located in and serve Khayelitsha, but were only opened in 2004/2005<sup>13</sup> - a year later than that which you have used as a base-year in your analysis. This of course resulted in reported cases being distributed amongst three stations from 2004 onwards rather than one, which considerably lessened the burden of cases on Khayelitsha (Site B) police station. It seems that your calculation took the total number of cases in 2003/2004 when there was only one police station (Khayelitsha Police Station<sup>14</sup>) serving the entire area, and compared it to the 2008/2009 statistics from that same station, neglecting cases from Harare and Lingeletu-West despite these stations today accounting for the majority of interpersonal violent crime in Khayelitsha<sup>15</sup>. This not only fails to provide an accurate gauge of the overall decrease in crime in broader Khayelitsha, but also the area covered by Khayelitsha Site B police station.

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.da.org.za/newsroom.htm?action=view-news-item&id=8633>

<sup>11</sup> [http://www.saps.gov.za/statistics/reports/crimestats/2010/provinces/w\\_cape/pdf/harare.pdf](http://www.saps.gov.za/statistics/reports/crimestats/2010/provinces/w_cape/pdf/harare.pdf)

<sup>12</sup> [http://www.saps.gov.za/statistics/reports/crimestats/2010/provinces/w\\_cape/pdf/lingeletuwest.pdf](http://www.saps.gov.za/statistics/reports/crimestats/2010/provinces/w_cape/pdf/lingeletuwest.pdf)

<sup>13</sup> See *Cape Argus* article (9 August 2004) in addendum

<sup>14</sup> [http://www.saps.gov.za/statistics/reports/crimestats/2010/provinces/w\\_cape/pdf/khayelitsha.pdf](http://www.saps.gov.za/statistics/reports/crimestats/2010/provinces/w_cape/pdf/khayelitsha.pdf)

<sup>15</sup> In 2008/2009 Khayelitsha Station reported 121 murders, Lingeletu West 43 murders, and Harare 119 murders. Similar trends are evident for sexual crimes, attempted murder, common assault, and assault with intent to inflict grievous bodily harm (GBH).



4. If the total number of cases from all three stations covering Khayelitsha in 2008/2009 are combined, the total comes to 12 665 cases (see below table) resulting in a decrease in five years of 23.92%, not 70% as claimed. Moreover, factoring in the statistics for 2009/2010 which show that total crime in Khayelitsha has increased, this decline is further reduced to 17.26% since 2003/2004.

	2003/2004	2008/2009	2009/2010
<b>Khayelitsha</b>	16648	5046	5370
<b>Lingeletu West</b>	0	2650	3010
<b>Harare</b>	0	4969	5395
<b>TOTAL:</b>	16648	12665	13775
<b>% change from 03/04</b>		23.92% (-)	17.26% (-)
<i>Crime in Khayelitsha (SAPS)</i>			

5. This miscalculation is especially problematic for a number of reasons. Most importantly, Khayelitsha – as one of the Western Cape’s most impoverished urban areas – bears a considerable and disproportionate burden of violent crime (and quite possibly property related crime). This is of course not only the case for Khayelitsha, but any densely populated urban area containing vast and historically under developed informal settlements. There are no quick wins in the fight against crime, particularly in areas such as these. We therefore fully agree with you when you say that pragmatic responses are needed to combat crime including coordinated projects with government and civil society, and improvements to infrastructure and access to basic services (such as lighting, roads, and access to toilets) which can have a considerable affect on one’s safety. But in order to successfully do this, we need to be realistic about the challenges and acknowledge the pervasiveness of crime in these areas. An accurate portrayal of the distribution and evolution of crime is crucial both for the public and policy makers alike.
6. We request that you please issue a correction to your 29 August 2010 statement. We ask that you do so by 15 September 2010. This should in no way undermine the commendable work done by the City and VPUU, which appears to be delivering tangible results in crime reduction
7. Thank you for considering our request.

Sincerely,



**Gavin Silber**  
Coordinator  
Social Justice Coalition



CRIME INFORMATION MANAGEMENT - SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE

Crime in Khayelitsha (WC) for April to March 2003/2004 to 2009/2010

Khayelitsha ceded Harare and Lingulethu West July 2004

Crime Category	April 2003 to March 2004	April 2004 to March 2005	April 2005 to March 2006	April 2006 to March 2007	April 2007 to March 2008	April 2008 to March 2009	April 2009 to March 2010
<b>CONTACT CRIME (CRIMES AGAINST THE PERSON)</b>							
Murder	358	213	219	198	171	121	124
Total Sexual Crimes	588	390	331	284	269	218	259
Attempted murder	395	187	102	96	78	60	91
Assault with the intent to inflict grievous bodily harm	3,089	1,522	893	669	617	556	554
Common assault	2,020	1,136	998	786	680	650	670
Common robbery	824	680	279	210	161	160	193
Robbery with aggravating circumstances	1,484	1,021	788	1,083	1,018	747	711
<b>CONTACT-RELATED CRIME</b>							
Arson	100	41	30	27	20	14	19
Malicious damage to property	1,161	643	478	537	346	361	333
<b>PROPERTY-RELATED CRIME</b>							
Burglary at non-residential premises	62	24	11	104	62	66	88
Burglary at residential premises	1,621	849	441	313	359	404	385
Theft of motor vehicle and motorcycle	272	153	98	134	135	96	114
Theft out of or from motor vehicle	215	136	62	112	51	54	76
Stock-theft	3	1	0	0	0	0	0
<b>CRIME HEAVILY DEPENDENT ON POLICE ACTION FOR DETECTION</b>							
Illegal possession of firearms and ammunition	242	109	73	94	111	88	93
Drug-related crime	380	233	235	377	468	448	549
Driving under the influence of alcohol or drugs	99	72	44	74	129	146	319
<b>OTHER SERIOUS CRIME</b>							
All theft not mentioned elsewhere	2,601	1,165	802	935	656	501	359
Commercial crime	103	52	44	36	49	42	47
Shoplifting	159	98	26	21	23	71	115
<b>SUBCATEGORIES FORMING PART OF AGGRAVATED ROBBERY ABOVE</b>							
Carjacking	126	73	59	52	42	33	22
Truck hijacking	8	2	0	0	3	2	0
Robbery at residential premises	8	25	31	121	65	62	73
Robbery at non-residential premises	6	1	11	50	41	40	62
<b>OTHER CRIME CATEGORIES</b>							
Culpable homicide	76	66	43	59	53	54	37
Public violence	24	8	22	24	14	14	19
Crimen injuria	449	168	83	54	33	27	37
Neglect and ill-treatment of children	113	52	25	19	18	7	20
Kidnapping	62	20	7	1	1	4	1
	<b>TOTAL: 16648</b>					<b>TOTAL: 5046</b>	



CRIME INFORMATION MANAGEMENT - SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE

Crime in Lingeletu-West (WC) for April to March 2003/2004 to 2009/2010

Lingeletu West was established from Khayelitsha July 2004

Crime Category	April 2003 to March 2004	April 2004 to March 2005	April 2005 to March 2006	April 2006 to March 2007	April 2007 to March 2008	April 2008 to March 2009	April 2009 to March 2010
<b>CONTACT CRIME (CRIMES AGAINST THE PERSON)</b>							
Murder	0	46	48	64	37	43	48
Total Sexual Crimes	0	80	138	109	85	89	99
Attempted murder	0	41	47	45	36	43	30
Assault with the intent to inflict grievous bodily harm	0	309	356	273	218	180	210
Common assault	0	363	365	309	225	249	333
Common robbery	0	201	210	158	67	49	71
Robbery with aggravating circumstances	0	289	360	447	262	201	194
<b>CONTACT-RELATED CRIME</b>							
Arson	0	7	14	16	8	6	10
Malicious damage to property	0	216	313	234	155	169	193
<b>PROPERTY-RELATED CRIME</b>							
Burglary at non-residential premises	0	5	32	64	35	43	61
Burglary at residential premises	0	233	297	260	228	220	328
Theft of motor vehicle and motorcycle	0	73	91	90	71	95	109
Theft out of or from motor vehicle	0	71	76	55	53	57	107
Stock-theft	0	0	1	0	0	0	0
<b>CRIME HEAVILY DEPENDENT ON POLICE ACTION FOR DETECTION</b>							
Illegal possession of firearms and ammunition	0	34	33	40	47	49	25
Drug-related crime	0	43	97	101	156	219	228
Driving under the influence of alcohol or drugs	0	16	31	51	119	142	202
<b>OTHER SERIOUS CRIME</b>							
All theft not mentioned elsewhere	0	401	351	396	312	298	301
Commercial crime	0	95	74	100	80	165	115
Shoplifting	0	1	39	120	103	201	231
<b>SUBCATEGORIES FORMING PART OF AGGRAVATED ROBBERY ABOVE</b>							
Carjacking	0	27	50	38	33	15	23
Truck hijacking	0	0	1	1	2	0	0
Robbery at residential premises	0	2	4	26	24	33	24
Robbery at non-residential premises	0	1	1	10	9	25	10
<b>OTHER CRIME CATEGORIES</b>							
Culpable homicide	0	13	14	26	20	18	19
Public violence	0	6	2	5	3	24	4
Crimen injuria	0	63	21	26	13	12	23
Neglect and ill-treatment of children	0	12	7	2	5	5	3
Kidnapping	0	4	0	5	3	0	9



CRIME INFORMATION MANAGEMENT - SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE

Crime in Harare (WC) for April to March 2003/2004 to 2009/2010

Harare was established from Khayelitsha July 2004

Crime Category	April 2003 to March 2004	April 2004 to March 2005	April 2005 to March 2006	April 2006 to March 2007	April 2007 to March 2008	April 2008 to March 2009	April 2009 to March 2010
<b>CONTACT CRIME (CRIMES AGAINST THE PERSON)</b>							
Murder	0	85	143	168	175	119	118
Total Sexual Crimes	0	211	267	225	259	248	273
Attempted murder	0	76	74	89	73	76	67
Assault with the intent to inflict grievous bodily harm	0	816	683	568	532	496	581
Common assault	0	519	737	896	848	750	863
Common robbery	0	279	261	247	209	158	136
Robbery with aggravating circumstances	0	368	491	638	610	481	344
<b>CONTACT-RELATED CRIME</b>							
Arson	0	29	32	40	26	22	43
Malicious damage to property	0	318	369	457	383	347	377
<b>PROPERTY-RELATED CRIME</b>							
Burglary at non-residential premises	0	12	27	42	37	63	87
Burglary at residential premises	0	461	469	451	459	526	541
Theft of motor vehicle and motorcycle	0	95	113	123	180	144	182
Theft out of or from motor vehicle	0	39	88	89	75	74	174
Stock-theft	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
<b>CRIME HEAVILY DEPENDENT ON POLICE ACTION FOR DETECTION</b>							
Illegal possession of firearms and ammunition	0	48	59	85	67	75	71
Drug-related crime	0	70	112	196	276	359	380
Driving under the influence of alcohol or drugs	0	20	36	64	136	160	381
<b>OTHER SERIOUS CRIME</b>							
All theft not mentioned elsewhere	0	670	489	846	618	547	477
Commercial crime	0	31	23	30	26	19	29
Shoplifting	0	35	25	28	15	33	24
<b>SUBCATEGORIES FORMING PART OF AGGRAVATED ROBBERY ABOVE</b>							
Carjacking	0	33	41	68	43	34	29
Truck hijacking	0	4	1	2	3	2	0
Robbery at residential premises	0	6	35	77	88	88	75
Robbery at non-residential premises	0	1	3	17	40	62	56
<b>OTHER CRIME CATEGORIES</b>							
Culpable homicide	0	16	37	35	20	35	32
Public violence	0	12	12	14	6	12	7
Crimen injuria	0	103	51	58	29	22	25
Neglect and ill-treatment of children	0	45	33	13	13	10	15
Kidnapping	0	6	11	14	0	7	7



Source: CAPE ARGUS

Date: 09-Aug-2004

Topic: 15

Ref No: 10543



1

ID: 03120886-01 Source Page: 5

# After 14 murders, Khayelitsha cops to divide and rule

ALL THREE of Khayelitsha's police stations - Khayelitsha, Lingeletu and Harare police stations - will have full operational control of their precincts.

Until now Khayelitsha station has had more resources than the other two stations.

Khayelitsha Community Police Forum members braved the cold weather at the weekend to attend a workshop aimed at decreasing crime in the area.

Last weekend 14 people were murdered in the township and police and residents became concerned.

About 120 representatives from 12 wards in Khayelitsha met in Tokai to map out new strategies to combat crime. The meeting was held under the auspices of the department of community safety.

One of the resolutions taken was that all three police stations would have their own station commissioner.

In this way, said forum

**MONDE DLAKAVU**  
Staff Reporter

chairman Mbuyiseli Boqwana, people in the three precincts would work in "problematic sections and try to neutralise known criminals".

Harare station commissioner

Captain Pumzile Cetyana said after the workshop that the new move and the spirit of the forum members would help in forging a lasting commitment to fighting crime.

"With three police stations working separately, we'll be able to tackle crime effectively. Khayelitsha is so big - dividing it was a good idea because we will be able to contain any problems," said Cetyana.

He also said his station, situated in western Khayelitsha, had dealt with two armed robberies in the past 10 days. Last Friday a Score store was robbed but quick reaction from police led to the arrest of two men. They had R20 000 in their possession.

And on Saturday a group, believed to be members of the

same gang, robbed the store of an undisclosed amount of money but were later arrested in Ezindlovini squatter camp

with a small amount of cash.

"In this robbery we also found a car the suspects were using," added Cetyana.

Commenting on the murders of 14 people in the township last weekend, he said: "This weekend we had lots of patrols in the identified areas and as a result we had

very few deaths."

The spate of deaths last weekend caused community members to call for more concrete security measures to be put in place.

One concerned resident at the meeting, who did not want to be named, said: "I need assurance that when I walk down to the spaza shop I won't be killed."

But she, like others, were optimistic that the future of Khayelitsha could be brighter.

The Khayelitsha Community Police Forum noted last night that some shebeen owners were not heeding the call to close at certain times.

The forum also felt that there was an urgent need "to set up more workshops to educate residents around issues of community policing".

The City of Cape Town has just signed a R60 million deal with Germany as part of an urban renewal and crime prevention initiative for Khayelitsha and Mitchell's Plain.

**'We had lots of  
patrols in  
identified areas'**



## Annexure B (Letter from Dianne Kohler Barnard to SJC – 15 September 2010)



**PARLIAMENT**  
OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

PO Box 15 Cape Town 8000 Republic of South Africa  
Tel: 27 (21) 403 2911  
[www.parliament.gov.za](http://www.parliament.gov.za)

15 September 2010

Dear Mr. Silber

Thank you for bringing this to my attention. You are quite right that the correct figure is a 24% reduction in crime in Khayelitsha, and a correction will be posted on our website, as well as with the press.

This reduction is still, of course, significant and encouraging. It is also important to note that the high growth in population density in the area serviced by these three stations since 2003 is not something taken into account in SAPS figures that record crime, but not crime as a proportion of population size. The 24% figure, then, is probably a significant underestimate of what has really taken place, but our original figure, as you point out, is not correct either.

I appreciate your positive comments about the progress being made in Khayelitsha, and am sure you are aware of the remarkable work that is going on there.

I am also happy to be able to report, based on new figures released from the Police, that the decrease in many of the most serious forms of crime in Khayelitsha has been quite exceptional. For instance, since 2003/04, common robbery is down by 51%, murder by 19%, attempted murder by 52%, malicious damage to property by 22% and assault with intent to do grievous bodily harm by 56%.

We do strive to get our information right, and it is regrettable that an error was made in this instance.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Dianne Kohler Barnard'.

Dianne Kohler Barnard  
**Shadow Minister of Police**  
Democratic Alliance



## **Annexure C** (Letter from Ross Van Der Linde to SJC – 17 September 2010)

Fri 2010/09/17 05:38 PM

**From: Ross Van Der Linde**

**To: Gavin Silber**

Cc: Dianne Kohler Barnard

Cc: Mireille Wenger

Dear Mr Silber

I believe you have been speaking to Mireille about the error in our crime statistics statement on August 29th.

I just wanted to update you that we have posted a correction on our website – the corrected statement is available [here](#) – and that a correction has been sent to the *Cape Times*, which ran the story on August 31st. According to our records, this was the only newspaper to run this story. The correction sets out what happened, makes it clear that an error was made, and apologises unambiguously; it is essentially the same as the correction in the website link above, though I can send you a copy if you wish.

I would imagine it will, in any case, be appearing during the course of the next week.

To the best of our knowledge, this issue has never been raised in the National Assembly. We have done a thorough search of parliamentary speeches, member's statements and other statements that might have been made there, and have not established any instances in which the issue or figure were mentioned. In the circumstances, I hope you understand that we do not see it as necessary to read a correction to Parliament.

Thank you for bringing this error to our attention. We do make a very concerted effort to get all of the information in our statements correct, and the mistake is regrettable, but it is important to set the record straight.

Kind regards

**Ross van der Linde**

Democratic Alliance

Chief Operations Officer: Parliament

Marks Building Office 331

t. 021 403 3575 | f. 086 572 6118 | c. 076 543 7254

[rossv@da.org.za](mailto:rossv@da.org.za) | [www.da.org.za](http://www.da.org.za)